

ETHICAL GUIDELINES FOR MHEALTH-BASED CLINICAL SUPPORT AMONG CLINICIANS IN LOW RESOURCE SETTINGS

A 3-DAY WORKSHOP AT THE BROCHER FOUNDATION, GENEVA

9-11 JANUARY 2019

Overarching aim of the workshop:

The workshop aims to lay the groundwork for the development of a guideline for good ethical practice in image-based mHealth practice for diagnostic and treatment consultation among clinicians.

The guidelines will incorporate key ethical issues such as patient autonomy and safety, and integrate perspectives from all users.

Structure of the workshop:

We plan for themed days, with a slightly different but complementary focus through each day's discussions. Themes are intended to cover issues at the levels of patients (both data and care, in terms of autonomy and safety) and the health care system (e.g. how health resources are distributed, and how mHealth may influence that).

Day 1 is on patient-related ethical issues – how mHealth challenges ethical principles as regards individuals – autonomy, non-maleficence, beneficence, justice – through different users.

Day 2 deals with health systems issues in the implementation and use of mHealth, including how principles of medical ethics are influenced, challenged and compete with one another (including utilitarianism and justice).

Day 3 is on incorporation of the results of the plenary and round tables discussions into an integrated guideline.

Discussions will take the form of whole-group brainstorming (intended to generate keywords and key principles to feed the guideline) and small-group roundtables (intended to generate statements which will also inform the guideline development).

Several sessions will start with a number of short contributions – live, or through video – to illustrate key aspects of the session and generate discussion.

DAY 1	
HOW MHEALTH CHALLENGES ETHICAL PRINCIPLES AS REGARDS INDIVIDUALS – AUTONOMY, NON-MALEFICENCE, BENEFICENCE, JUSTICE	
Session 1 0900-0930	INTRODUCTION AND WELCOMING MESSAGES Chair: Brocher representative, Lee Wallis, Lucie Laflamme
Session 2 0930-1230 [includes TEA/COFFEE 1045-1115]	THE LANDSCAPE OF IMAGE-BASED MHEALTH AMONG CLINICIANS IN HEALTH CARE SETTINGS Chair: Lee Wallis, Lucie Laflamme Speakers –10 min each <u>Johan Lundin</u> Title: <i>Artificial intelligence for improved access to diagnostics at the point-of-care</i> <u>Antoine Geissbuhler</u> Title: <i>Mobile technologies to support isolated care professionals: the experience of the RAFT network</i> <u>Adriana Velaquez Berumen</u> Title: TBC <u>Vula App developers</u> Session Aim: Explore ethical perspectives on, and identify key challenges with, the use of mHealth in health care, from the perspective of patients, clinicians, and the health system. Preliminary topics for discussion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The notion of autonomy and protection of individual information/data • What specific challenges exist with pictures of individual patients? • What are the perspectives of users, and how do we involve all stakeholders? Format: Brainstorming and prep for feedback <i>1 hour</i> Output: Determination of keywords to guide on-going discussions. What are the biggest current issues (patient, clinician, health system)? <i>Feedback 45 mins</i> Summary <u>Nikki Williams</u>
1230-1315	LUNCH
Session 3 1315-1445	MEDICAL ETHICS AND MHEALTH – PATIENT INTEGRITY AND AUTONOMY Chair: Andreas Reis, Alain Labrique Speakers: 10 mins each <u>Sabine Koch</u> Title: <i>Ethical issues during development and use of mHealth tools</i>

	<p><u>Maurice Mars</u> Title: 'Spontaneous', Instant-Messaging-Based Telemedicine, a Simple mHealth Solution for the Developing World. Ethical Issues From the Coalface.</p> <p><u>Keymanthri Moodley</u> Title: Image-based mHealth: opportunities for and challenges to autonomy</p> <p>Session aim: Highlight the key issues around integrity and autonomy that App developers and researchers need to address when developing or studying mHealth.</p> <p>Preliminary topics for discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Why are integrity and autonomy compromised through this technology? • What are the challenges for protecting integrity and autonomy? • How should major challenges be overcome, both in the short and long term? <p>Format: Roundtable 30 mins</p> <p>Output: Determination of keywords to guide on-going discussions Feedback 20 mins</p> <p>Summary <u>Niklas Juth</u></p>
1445-1500	TEA /COFFEE
Session 4 1500-1630	<p>MEDICAL ETHICS AND MHEALTH – BUILDING IN PATIENT SAFETY (NON-MALEFICENCE AND BENEFICENCE PRINCIPLES)</p> <p>Chair: Ousmane Ly, Abha Saxena</p> <p>Speakers – 10 mins each</p> <p><u>Bruce Dahlman</u> Title: Addressing Non-Malfeasance by improving Relevance of Clinical Evidence in mHealth Decision Support Tools</p> <p><u>Isaac Bogoch</u> Title: Ethical considerations for image-based diagnostics to enable high-quality care in low-resource settings: a discussion of issues and potential solutions</p> <p><u>Halima Adam</u> Title: How does mHealth safety fit into daily clinical frontline practice in low resource limited settings?</p> <p>Session aim: Identification of critical aspects for “best practice” model for mHealth systems, having patient safety in mind.</p> <p>Preliminary topics for discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What aspects need to be built in to such technology? • What can go wrong? That is - what are the risks for the patient and provider?

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How should we build in patient safety? This is - how do we protect from delays, errors <p>Format: Roundtable <i>30 mins</i></p> <p>Output: A set of keywords to help shape the guideline development process <i>Feedback 20 mins</i></p> <p>Summary <u>Adriana Berumen</u></p>
1630-1700	<p>SUMMARY / WRAP UP – REFLECTIONS ON THE KEYWORDS</p> <p>Chair: Lee Wallis, Lucie Laflamme</p>

<p style="text-align: center;">DAY 2</p> <p style="text-align: center;">HOW MHEALTH CHALLENGES ETHICS IN HEALTH SYSTEMS AND FOR CARE DELIVERY BY HEALTH WORKERS – e.g. UTILITARIANISM, JUSTICE</p>	
0830-0915	<p>INTRODUCTION AND RECAP</p> <p>All day 1 sessions chairs to feedback impressions</p>
Session 5 0915-1100	<p>THE HEALTH SYSTEM PERSPECTIVE – TECHNICAL AND HUMAN PERSPECTIVES</p> <p>Chair: Marie Hasselberg, Eddie Mukooyo</p> <p>Speakers – live and on video: 10 mins each</p> <p><u>Jennifer Chipps</u> Title: <i>Can mHealth serve as a mechanism to enhance health systems to ensure care delivery and responsiveness?</i></p> <p><u>Niklas Juth</u> Title: <i>Utilitarian and justice-based considerations in mHealth systems</i></p> <p><u>Nikki Allorto</u></p> <p>Session aim: Reflect on whether and how mHealth can serve as a mechanism to enhance health systems to ensure care delivery and responsiveness.</p> <p>Preliminary topics for discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the key healthcare-worker challenges to integration of mHealth into daily practice while allowing maintenance of utilitarianism and justice? <p>Format: Brainstorming 30 mins</p> <p>Output: A set of core health system components for the guideline Feedback 20 mins</p> <p>Summary <u>Alain Labrique</u></p>
1100-1130	<p>TEA / COFFEE</p>
Session 6 1130-1300	<p>HEALTH CARE PERSPECTIVE – CLINICAL CODE OF CONDUCT AND THE NOTION OF RESPONSIBILITY</p> <p>Chair: Lucy Gilson, Nikki Williams</p> <p>Speakers: 10 mins each</p> <p><u>France Légaré</u> Title: <i>No decision about us without us using mHealth or is it?</i></p> <p><u>Hendry Sawe</u> Title: <i>Impact of mHealth systems on Resource maximization and Doctor–patient partnership</i></p>

	<p><u>Joseph Ali</u> Title: <i>Emerging medicolegal issues for image-based and other related clinical applications of mHealth</i></p> <p>Session aim: Reflect on challenges that mHealth can bring to strengthen the clinical code of conduct.</p> <p>Preliminary topics for discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the key issues with regard to the code of conduct that are threatened or strengthened by mHealth systems? <p>Format: Roundtable 30 mins</p> <p>Output: A set of core patient and clinician elements for the guideline <i>Feedback 20 mins</i></p> <p>Summary <u>Olola Oneko</u></p>
1300-1345	LUNCH
1345 – 1500	<p>SPEAKERS' CORNER – ON ANY USER OR SYSTEM PERSPECTIVE</p> <p>Chair: Johan Lundin, Keymanthri Moodley</p> <p>Session aim: To allow formal inputs from those who have not yet had an opportunity to present, with regard to the discussions so far</p> <p>Format: Speaker's corner</p>
1500-1515	TEA / COFFEE
Session 7 1515 – 1630	<p>GUIDELINE DEVELOPMENT PART 1 – KEY WORDS AND STRUCTURE</p> <p>Chair: Lucie Laflamme, Lee Wallis</p> <p>Moderator: Nikki Williams</p> <p>Session aim: On basis of the brainstorming and roundtable discussions, draft the main lines of the clinical guideline for mHealth development and implementation in general, and image-based solutions in particular, in order to especially Low Resource Settings.</p> <p>Format: Roundtable</p> <p>Output: A draft of the guideline</p>
Session 8 1630 – 1700	SUMMARY / WRAP UP

	Chair: Guy Dumont, Nikki Williams
--	--

DAY 3**TO DEVELOP OF AN OUTLINE GUIDELINE, AND TIMEFRAME FOR COMPLETION**

Session 9 0830 – 1030	GUIDELINE DEVELOPMENT PART 2 – ON PATIENT AND CLINICAL USER AUTONOMY Chair: Lee Wallis, Lucie Laflamme Session aim: To develop an outline of the Guideline, looking at ethical principles in Low Resource Settings Format: Roundtable and plenary
1030 – 1100	TEA/COFFEE
Session 10 1100 – 1300	GUIDELINE DEVELOPMENT PART 3 – ON PATIENT SAFETY AND PROVISION OF HEALTH CARE Chair: Marie Hasselberg, Antoine Geissbuhler Session aim: To develop an outline of the Guideline, looking at ethical principles in Low Resource Settings Format: Roundtable and plenary
1300 – 1400	LUNCH
Session 11 1400 - 1530	WRAP UP AND WAY AHEAD Chair: Lee Wallis, Lucie Laflamme